

## PLANNING COMMISSION AGENDA STATEMENT

Item: 1  
Meeting Date: 11/14/07

**ITEM TITLE:** Public Hearing: Conditional Use Permit (PCC-07-064) for the development of the Concordia Lutheran Church Private Elementary Middle School -and Pre-School in the Village of Windingwalk (Village 11), located at the easterly terminus of Birch Road and Discovery Falls Drive.

The proposed project consists of a church with a 225-student kindergarten through eighth grade school and a 192-student pre-school. The proposed site will consist of four buildings: a 19,200-square foot two-story classroom/fellowship hall; a 12,600-square foot single-story pre-school classroom building; a 15,100-square foot multi-purpose gymnasium; and a 13,900-square foot church sanctuary building with a seating capacity of 600 seats. A total of 40 full-time employees will be situated on a project site plan that provides 238~~24~~ parking spaces.

The Environmental Review Coordinator has reviewed the proposed project for compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act and has determined that the proposed project was adequately covered in previously adopted Final Second Tier EIR (EIR-01-02) for the Otay Ranch General Plan Amendments/Village 11 Sectional Planning Area Plan and Tentative Map, and the Addendum to EIR-01-02 approved September 19, 2007. Thus, no further environmental review or documentation is necessary.

**BOARDS/COMMISSIONS RECOMMENDATION:** The Design Review Committee (DRC) preliminarily reviewed the design of the project at their November 5, 2007 meeting and provided some suggestions for minor revisions to the architecture and certain site plan features further discussed below. The DRC will ~~and will~~ hold a formal public hearing at a later date to evaluate the expected revisions at a later date after the CUP is approved.

**RECOMMENDATION:** That the Planning Commission approves ~~Resolution~~ PCC-07-064 including the required findings for approval and subject to the conditions contained therein.

### BACKGROUND:

On October 2, 2006, Brookfield Shea Otay (BSO), the developer of Otay Ranch Windingwalk Village 11, submitted a Sectional Planning Area (SPA) Plan and Master Precise Plan (MPP) Amendment and Revised Tentative Map application. The ~~proposed~~ amendments ~~to the SPA Plan and Tentative Map~~ revisions propose to relocate the Village 11 Town Square from the easterly terminus of Birch Road to the northeast corner of Discovery Falls Drive and Windingwalk Street ~~and~~ \_\_\_\_\_. ~~The~~ proposal also includes the relocation of the pedestrian easement from the easterly terminus of Birch Road to the northern property boundary of the proposed Community

Purpose Facility (CPF) site. However, consistent with the policy discussed and agreed to by BSO prior to receipt by the City of the applications, a Conditional Use Permit (CUP) application by the proposed user of the CPF-1 site (~~Concordia Lutheran Church~~) was still needed for submittal prior to further review for entitlements.

~~The Conditional Use Permit (CUP) application was submitted by Concordia Lutheran Church~~  
Concordia Lutheran Church and School submitted the Conditional Use Permit (CUP) application on April 10, 2007. In an effort to relocate to a site that is perhaps more central to their current and future membership base within the South Bay region, this eleemosynary religious and educational facility is currently located in Western Chula Vista, at 267 East Oxford Street near Melrose Street.

After the first review of the CUP application, staff met with BSO and the Lutheran Church to assess their needs and the ability to provide and maintain an appropriate combination of public access space, paseo access, village green and architectural backdrop, all mandatory design element of the Village 11 SPA Plan and Village Core Master Precise Plan (MPP). Several site plan iterations were sketched and general agreement was reached on possible redesigns and reconfiguration of the CPF and Town Square project sites.

On June 15, 2007 an assessment letter was sent to Concordia Lutheran Church requesting that they retain provide certain mandatory site planning elements on the CPF site ~~as required by the Village Core MPP and Village 11 SPA Plan.~~ T and that these are elements that must be retained be provided in some form in order to allow for the SPA Amendment and Revised Tentative Map modifications to the CPF and Town Square planning areas to be made ~~that would maintain~~ compliance with the ~~to the~~ Village Core MPP and Village 11 SPA Plan.

Specifically:

- (1) That the proposed central plaza be provided as a usable public access space and be maintained as an open space focal point location, in order to justify the relocation of the Town Square to the northeast corner of Discovery Falls Drive and Windingwalk Street as a corner park, and*
- (2) That a pedestrian path through the central plaza be provided and maintained as the most direct pedestrian circulation route to the village paseo, in order to justify the relocation of the pedestrian easement to the northern property line boundary of the CPF site, adjacent to the Private Recreational Facility (PRF) site.*

On July 27, 2007, ~~the~~ a revised site plan was submitted incorporating the modifications needed to address the mandatory public access space and pedestrian connection through the site; namely, the 70-ft wide plaza shown on the previous CUP application ~~for the CPF-1 site~~ was increased to 120-ft. wide ~~90-ft. clear between arcades of the Pre-School and Fellowship Hall buildings,~~ to try and match the 120-ft. Birch Road right-of-way width and further encourage public access, and the pedestrian connection was revised to shown a more clear ~~horizontally clear and vertically unobstructed pedestrian~~ 20-ft. wide path around the Sanctuary/Worship Building which ~~could be visually more~~

encourage ~~ing for approaching~~ pedestrians to access the ~~V~~village ~~P~~paseo through the center of the site.

The Design Review Committee (DRC) preliminarily reviewed the project on November 5, 2007. At the meeting, the -DRC suggested that certain site plan and architectural features be enhanced. The applicant agreed to further articulate the central plaza with more landscaping and seating. In addition, improve the visual connection to the Village Paseo with a more landscape features as well as pavement enhancements. In addition, the applicant agreed to further articulate the Irving Gill architecture, specifically in color, material and design of the roof and arcade elements.

## **DISCUSSION:**

### Site Characteristics

The project site consists of a vacant 5.51-acre area parcel located at the easterly terminus of Birch Road in the village core of Windingwalk (Village 11). Birch Road terminates into the site coming from the west, where it T's into Discovery Falls Drive to the east. The project site can be viewed from Eastlake Parkway and the Otay Ranch Town Center. The site has been rough graded and is generally flat; however there is a significant slope to the south down to Windingwalk Street where the relocated park and the church multi-purpose gymnasium are to be located.

A single vehicular access to the project site will be ~~from a shared single driveway that will also be used by the Private Recreational Facility (PRF) Swim Club site located~~ provided along Discovery Falls Drive near the Private Recreational Facility (PRF) Swim Club site and south of the roundabout of Exploration Falls Drive. The driveway is approximately 300-ft. to the north of the central plaza at the terminus of Birch Road located, and is where the applicant proposes to relocate the 20-ft. pedestrian easement that currently exists at the center of the site. The pedestrian easement, a mandatory site plan connection to the Village Paseo, is proposed to be located at the terminus of the Village Paseo, which runs north-south from Hunte Parkway to the PRF site.

### General Plan, Zoning and Land Use

The General Plan and Otay Ranch General Development Plan describe Village Eleven as a typical residential village including single-family, multi-family and mixed-uses. The village core provides all of these land uses, with multi-family and commercial mixed-uses across the street from the Community Purpose Facility (CPF-1) site. The CPF-1 site is the focal point site at the center of the village core in Village Eleven.

The subject property is zoned Planned Community (PC) within the Village Eleven SPA Plan Planned Community (PC) District Regulations, and the PC District land use designation is CPF-1 (Community Purpose Facility). The church, pre-school and Elementary/middle School ~~elementary school~~ are listed as Community Purpose Facility (CPF) land uses in the PC District Regulations, and the zoning for the subject property is CPF. All of the CPF permitted uses are conditionally permitted and subject to a Design Review approval by the Design Review Committee and a

Conditional Use Permit approval by the Planning Commission.

The current surrounding land use designations and land uses are:

North:	Private Recreational Facility (PRF), Pool Clubhouse and Rose Garden
South:	<del>Corner</del> <u>Proposed Corner</u> Park (P-2), relocated Town Square
East:	Chula Vista Elementary School District Site (S-1)
West:	Birch Road Terminus, Live-Work Storefront Commercial (MU-1 - “The Marketplace”) and Three Multi-Family Neighborhoods (Combined R-24 and R-25 – “Saguaro,” “Agave” and “Aristata”).

### Proposal

The proposal is for a 13,900-sq. ft. church sanctuary building with a seating capacity of 600 seats to be located directly behind a central plaza, which will serve as the architectural and landmark focal point of the CPF site at the terminus of Birch Road. The project also includes a 225-student K – 8 ~~elementary/middle school~~ Elementary/middle School and 192-student pre-school. Dual school and church buildings consist of a 19,200-sq. ft. two-story classroom/fellowship hall to the right of the central plaza, and a 12,600-sq. ft. single story pre-school classroom building to the left of the central plaza. A 15,100-sq. ft. multi-purpose gymnasium is proposed to be located in the southeast corner of the CPF site along Windingwalk Street, east of the relocated Town Square (P-2) located at the corner of Discovery Falls Drive and Windingwalk ~~Street.~~ Street.

A ~~224~~ 238-space parking lot is primarily located in the northeast quadrant of the site, and the parking field essentially fills out the remainder of the site behind the pre-school building, the worship center and the gymnasium building adjacent to the Village Paseo and the Chula Vista Elementary School District Site (S-1).

A parking analysis has been prepared as part of a traffic study report. The traffic report concludes that the 224-space parking lot will exceed the needs of the project site for a Church, Pre-School and Elementary/Middle School. The traffic study as well as the operational profile reflects that as long as there won't be an overlap of more than two uses, or simultaneous full-capacity use of all buildings, the maximum parking demand will be for 171 parking spaces.

~~Parking for use of the church, pre-school and elementary school at full capacity would require 252 parking spaces according to the off-street parking requirements in the Village 11 PC District Regulations, creating a shortfall of 14 parking spaces. However, the 238-space parking lot should serve the needs of the project site, since the operational profile reflects that there will not be any overlap of more than two uses, or simultaneous use of all buildings concurrently.~~

~~Nevertheless, the applicant has indicated that a shared parking agreement will be arranged with the adjacent swim club homeowners associated, so that the shared driveway access across the relocated pedestrian easement will also allow for overflow parking for special events. This parking~~

~~arrangement will be entered into under a private agreement and not subject to this conditional use permit, since both sites have adequate internal parking.~~

## ANALYSIS:

### Site Plan:

The site layout is similar to the conceptual illustrations provided in the original Village 11 SPA Plan Village Design Plan and Village Core Master Precise Plan, where community purpose buildings were shown surround~~ing~~ a town square park instead of a central plaza.

The church school campus, consisting of four buildings totaling 60,800-sq. ft. of gross floor area, arranges itself away from Windingwalk Street by relocating the Town Square to the corner. While the multi-purpose gymnasium is visible from Windingwalk, there is no pedestrian access to the site along Windingwalk Street except from the Village Paseo.

The down slope of the CPF site is taken up entirely along Windingwalk Way and on the north and east sides of the Town Square corner park. By relocating the Town Square to the corner, the applicant is able eliminate any slope impacts on the site from any of the open spaces relationships in between the four campus buildings.

There are no specific design standards established by the Village 11 SPA Plan Planned Community (PC) District Regulations or the Zoning Code for outdoor playground areas for pre-schools or private elementary schools. The site plan shows a playground on the north side of the pre-school building that the applicant claims is of a required size and dimension imposed by state regulations. There is also a small grass area between the gymnasium and the Village Paseo that could be used by Elementary/middle school students.

~~Arrangements or agreements to be able to use the public elementary school site located across the Village Paseo or perhaps the City's neighborhood park further to the east across Exploration Falls Drive may be necessary in the future.~~

Specific building height and setback zoning standards are specified for the CPF site in the Planned Community (PC) District Regulations, but may be modified by the Design Review and Conditional Use Permit reviews. All buildings meet the 35-ft. height and 15-ft. setback recommended without requesting any deviation. The sanctuary building would have a steeple element that reaches 45-ft. in height, which is allowed as an architectural feature. The two-story classroom building/fellowship hall and the multi-purpose gymnasium are 35-ft. tall. The one-story pre-school building is 22-ft. height. The tower elements on each side of the central plaza are 35-ft. and 28-ft. tall respectively.

### Architecture:

The Village 11 SPA Village Design Plan and the Master Precise Plan guidelines state that the Irving Gill architectural theme should influence the architecture of the buildings, utilizing simple massing, strong window rhythms and patterns, arched entry portals and low slung hip roofs. In addition,

buildings should incorporate massing of larger buildings and shall incorporate vertical elements such as towers. The building materials used should include colors, forms and textures including stone in conformance with the Windingwalk Village and Otay Ranch theme.

It appears that the conceptual plans and elevations are striving to meet the mandatory site plan elements, which require architectural focal point and landmark features such as the proposed raised box arched canopy tower features on the corners of the pre-school and fellowship hall buildings. The worship center building itself proposes a focal point landmark steeple or tower feature. The architecture of the buildings is somewhat masked by the arched arcade elements ~~situated in front of them.~~

As noted above, the Design Review Committee provided a preliminary Design Review on November 5<sup>th</sup>, but a Design Review application has not yet been submitted. Per the preliminary Design Review comments of the Conditional Use Permit plans (attached), the ~~It is unknown at this time what other types of colors and~~ materials, such as stone, to be utilized on the buildings or arcade elements will determined when the DRC application is made~~may be utilized on the buildings or arcade elements.~~

~~While the Design Review Committee provided a preliminary Design Review on November 5<sup>th</sup>, a Design Review application has not yet been submitted. T~~However, the applicant has agreed to meet or exceed the mandatory site plan elements and provide exceptional architectural design for their buildings if the Conditional Use Permit and the SPA Amendment and Revised Tentative Map -is approved that would allow for the relocation of the Town Square. ~~In addition, staff believes the pre-school and fellowship hall classroom buildings should be located closer to Discovery Falls Drive, in order to provide a level of architectural detail that will compliment the pedestrian orientation of the village.~~

#### Landscaping:

A conceptual landscape plan will also be provided as part of the Design Review application to be submitted. The landscape plan ~~must~~ will provide details showing that there is a minimum 10 percent landscape coverage within the ~~22438 parking space parking lot~~ parking space parking area and the overall minimum 15 percent landscaping for the entire site. ~~The central plaza should also include more soft scape features.~~

#### Parking:

According to the Village 11 Sectional Planning Area (SPA) Plan Planned Community (PC) District Regulations, the parking requirements Community Purpose Facility uses can be modified subject to the Design Review Committee approval of the site plan.



The parking analysis that was provided as part of the traffic study report concluded that the maximum demand for parking on the site would be 171 spaces. In addition, based on the hours of operation analysis below, the 224-space parking lot will exceed the needs of the project site, since the operational profile reflects that there will not be any overlap of more than two uses, or simultaneous full-capacity use of all buildings.

Of note, considering the parking standards in the Village 11 SPA Plan, the Cfor church es-would need require-one parking-space for every 3.5 seats in the Sanctuary-3.5 seats in the sanctuary or main auditorium.- For the elementary/middle school,Elementary/Middle School, the requirement is one parking space for every employee, plus five spaces. For the pPre-Sschool, the requirement is one space for every staff member plus one space for every 5 children.-

The Church Sanctuary has a seating capacity for 600 patrons, demanding 171 spaces. According to the plans, the sanctuary has a seating capacity of 600 patrons, requiring 171 spaces. Of note, no seating was shown on the submitted floor plan for the sanctuary, and without seating the requirement would be one space for every 45-sq. ft. of gross floor area within the 13,900-sq. ft. worship center, or 308 parking spaces.

The application states that there will be a maximum of 40 employees on the church and school campus.-The Eelementary-/Middle Sschool with a ill require a staff of 182, and the church a staff of 6, for a total of 18, plus the 5 spaces for a total of required by code for a total of 23 parking spaces. The Ppre-Sschool with ill require a staff of 20, plus 38 forand -the 192 students will require 38 spaces, for a total of 58 parking spaces. So t

The total parking needed requirement would be 252 parking spaces if the Ppre-school, Eelementary/Middle S-school and Cchurch operations were all occur occurred ring simultaneously would be 252 spaces at the same ti.me.

However, as noted below in the hours of operation analysis, the 238-space parking lot should serve the needs of the project site, since the operational profile reflects that there will not be any overlap of more than two uses, or simultaneous use of all buildings concurrently.

As mentioned above, the applicant has indicated that a shared parking agreement will be arranged with the adjacent swim club homeowners association, so that the shared driveway access across the relocated pedestrian easement will also allow for overflow parking for special events. This parking arrangement will be entered into under a private agreement and not subject to this conditional use permit, since both sites have adequate internal parking.

### Hours of Operation

According to the project description, there are four major activity centers with following hours of operation:

	Saturday	Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday
<b>Sanctuary:</b>	4pm-12pm	6:30am-1:30pm	7pm-9pm	7pm-9pm	7pm-9pm	7pm-9pm	7pm-9pm

<b>Pre-School:</b>	Closed	Closed	6am – 7pm	6am – 7pm	6am – 7pm	6am – 7pm	6am – 7pm
<b>Fellowship Hall/ K-8 School:</b>	9am – 9pm	8am – 8pm	8am – 3:30pm; 5pm-10pm	8am – 3:30pm; 5pm-10pm	8am – 3:30pm; 5pm-10pm	8am – 3:30pm; 5pm-10pm	8am – 3:30pm; 5pm-10pm
<b>Gymnasium:</b>	9am – 9pm	9am – 9pm	6am – 9pm	6am – 9pm	6am – 9pm	6am – 9pm	6am – 9pm

Special events such as holiday services, and rehearsals for and services for events such as weddings, funerals, etc. are occasional and therefore do not need to be evaluated for weekly scheduling.

However, the applicant has included a matrix of how these activities might overlap, and it appears that the timeframe between 5 pm and 7 pm on weekday nights could be problematic if all four of the activity centers are filled to capacity, especially when parents are arriving to pick up children.

Staff recommends that since the pre-school remains open until 7:00 pm, that the K- 8 elementary and middle school/fellowship hall only be open for the varied group gatherings in the evening (such as assemblies, fine arts, adult school, boy scouts, outside service organization use, etc.) between the hours of 7:00 pm and 10:00 pm Monday through Friday, instead of 5:00 pm to 10:00 pm noted in the schedule. This would be similar to the weekday schedule for the sanctuary between 7:00 pm and 9:00 pm Monday through Friday. To prevent the potential for conflict resulting from overlapping demand for parking, condition 1-D of the resolution of approval memorializes this change.

## CONCLUSION:

The proposed church, pre-school and elementary school are conditional land uses within the Village 11 SPA Plan Planned Community (PC) District Regulations. This particular eleemosynary religious and educational facility is currently located in Western Chula Vista, at 267 East Oxford Street near Melrose Street. If the Village 11 SPA Plan Amendment and Revised Tentative Map are approved by the City Council at a later date, this Conditional Use Permit approval by the Planning Commission would enable this facility to be able to be relocated to Eastern Chula Vista.

For the applicant, the site provides a more desirable location that is perhaps more central to their current and future membership base within the South Bay region. The existing 4-acre facility is to be developed into a 24-lot single-family home subdivision by the Village 11 developers. Such an approval would facilitate an effort by the applicant to provide the same eleemosynary religious and educational facility at a prime Community Purpose Facility (CPF) zoned location.

Staff recommends approval of the project based on the findings and conditions as noted in the draft Planning Commission resolution.

~~If approved by the Planning Commission, this elementary religious and educational facility that is currently located in Western Chula Vista (267 East Oxford Street near Melrose Street) will now be able to relocate into Eastern Chula Vista in an effort to provide the same community purpose uses~~



~~within a new facility and at a new location that is perhaps more central to their current membership base or desired future membership base within the South Bay region. Staff recommends approval of the project based on the findings and conditions as noted in the draft Planning Commission resolution.~~

**ATTACHMENTS:**

1. Locator Map
2. Draft Planning Commission Resolution PCC-07-064
- ~~3. Draft Mitigated Negative Declaration IS-07-032~~
- ~~4.3. Application Documents with Disclosure Statements~~
- ~~5.4. Site Plans/Floor Plans/Elevations~~

~~J:\PLANNING\HAROLD\PCC-07-064REPORT SD COMMENTS.DOC J:\PLANNING\HAROLD\PCC-07-064REPORT.DOC~~

- ~~1. Page: 7  
Does an elementary school typically include 6<sup>th</sup>, 7<sup>th</sup> and 8<sup>th</sup> grades?~~
- ~~2. Page: 7  
Isn't this supposed to list the "current" land use designations?~~
- ~~3. Page: 7  
See the comments above from the first time you used this.~~
- ~~4. Page: 7  
Should?~~
- ~~5. Page: 7  
Is it really adequate if it is short 14 spaces?~~
- ~~1. Page: 7  
The Village 11 SPA Plan states that all required parking needs to be on site, or if an irrevocable access and/or parking agreement is obtained on an adjacent site. Don't we need to see that such an agreement exists? The SPA plan does not allow for deviations or reductions.~~
- ~~1. Page: 8  
If there are seats, but 1 space per 45 square feet if there are no fixed seats. Are there fixed seats?~~
- ~~1. Page: 8  
Are fixed seats identified?~~
- ~~1. Page: 8  
Does the SPA Plan allow this reduction?~~
- ~~1. Page: 8  
We need to see this to make sure it exists.~~
- ~~1. Page: 8  
Run on sentence~~